

COMPARTMENT REVIEW RECORD OF CHANGES AND DECISIONS

Michigan Department of Natural Resources

Pigeon River Country Forest Management Unit

2017 Year-of-Entry

Pigeon River Country Headquarters

September 22, 2015



The following documents the changes and decisions made at the compartment review to the Inventory database, reports, and compartment maps presented at open house for the PRC Forest Management Unit compartment review. This document is the official record of changes and decisions. Proposals originally presented were approved unless noted below.

Attendees

Greg Rekowski, FRD; Tim Greco, FRD; Brian Mastenbrook, WLD; Kerry Fitzpatrick, WLD; Steve Milford, FRD; Dan Heckman, FRD; Paige Perry, PRD; Scott Whitcomb, FRD; Pete Datema, FRD.

Comments from Stakeholders

Joe Jarecki:

I think that folks thoughtfully considered what the PRC should look like to be consistent with the Concept of Management plus Division and Department standards and proposed appropriate 2017 YOЕ recommendations. Documents associated with the Compartment Review are important historical records where DNR staff and the public alike can get an overview of what is planned for the near future as well as can learn what long term objectives are in the process of being implemented. It is important that these documents be as comprehensive and accurate as possible. My comments are intended to help achieve those objectives.

As I said at the Open House on July 23rd, I noticed that the data in parts of Reports 1 and 2 is not consistent with the data on the stand sheets and/or the data in Report 4. I recommend that the formulas used to build the tables be modified to accurately reflect the information in the stand sheets and data in Report 4. I did not extensively compare the data in the stand sheets with that in Reports 1 and 2, so I do not know how significant the issue is. The two inconsistencies that caused me to bring this up are:

- *In Report 1 for Compartment 8, the aspen 60 – 69 age class is listed as being only 2 acres, while both Report 4 – Treatments, and Report 8 – Forested Stands, say that 36 acre Aspen, Spruce/Fir Stand 17 is 66 years old.*
- *In Report 2 under the Acres of Harvest section, all compartments say the Commercial Harvest is 0, while all compartments actually have prescribed commercial harvest acreage.*

Prior to 2011, compartment information packages included a table showing the management objective by cover type. It was a good way to see what cover type changes were planned which helped give an understanding of the big picture plan for the compartment that is not now possible unless stand sheets are carefully read, especially with respect to conversion plans of aspen, red pine, and grass/upland brush. I request that the management objective by cover type table be reinstated.

The Mineral Resource and Development Concerns and/or Restrictions section for each compartment address the mineral development restrictions that are in place for the PRC as described in the Concept of Management. All compartment presentations appropriately indicate that surface mining (gravel, sand, etc.) is not being considered. Oil and gas restrictions in the Concept vary depending on whether the compartment (or part of it) is in the Consent Order Area or the Annexed Area. All 2017 YOE compartments are entirely in the Consent Order Area. While the compartment presentations for compartments 8, 16, and 29 appropriately say that there are no plans to engage in oil and gas development, they also say that nondevelopment oil and gas leasing may be considered. Since those compartments are in the Consent Order Area and therefore not subject to having nondevelopment leases issued according to the Concept, I recommend deleting the nondevelopment language and substituting language similar to that used in the presentations for compartments 36 and 42 which says: “the entire Compartment is in the Consent Order Area and, as provided on page 33 of the Concept of Management, no new leases will be issued in this Area.”

Land management activities such as timber sales, mechanical reforestation, some opening maintenance activities and prescribed burns have the potential to impact the pathway tread and/or the pathway markings of a pathway that runs through or adjacent to the activity. In the recent past, there has been both excellent pathway integrity management and just moderate pathway integrity management in timber sales. I recommend that all land management activities that might affect pathways be implemented in a way that has minimal impact on the pathway (limit the crossing of pathways, retain the pathway markings, require the contractor to immediately repair any damage, etc.), or that the pathway be rerouted prior to the activity.

Compartment 8

The second sentence of the Ownership Patterns, Development, and Land Use in and Around the Compartment section references private land that is now state land, so the reference should be removed.

Map:

- *I think the pointer that goes to the stand 74 label should be going to the stand 56 label instead.*
- *Consider changing the symbol for Webber road to “County Poor Dirt Road”.*

Compartment 16

In the Recreational Facilities and Opportunities section, consider saying “North Spur of the Shore to Shore Riding and Hiking Trail/Midland to Mackinac Trail” rather than “horse/hiking trail”.

Map:

- *As we discussed at the Open House, the horse trail is not accurately located in several places. It actually follows open and closed roads, but is not shown as being on the road in stands 1, 2, 62 and 66. (It is also incorrectly located in compartment 17, stand 57 and compartment 33, stands 18, 22, 23, 16 & 9.)*
- *The Rd 46 label in the NE part of stand 66 should be Rd 45 while the Rd 46 label in the SW part of stand 66 is correct.*
- *The road labeled “Crossover Road” is actually Rd 54, and the closed road depicted should be closer to parallel to Rd 54 rather than meeting the south end of it.*
- *Consistent with other lakes, Hemlock Lake should be named/labeled.*
- *Even though the horse trail symbol covers it, Rd 116 to Cornwall dam should be labeled.*
- *It is outside of the compartment, but the west end of Chaffee trail actually ends closer to the boundary between stands 73 and 74 than where it is depicted on the map.*

Compartment 29

The last word in the Watershed and Fisheries Considerations comments should be “compartment” instead of “stand”. On the map, Rd 40 in stand 20 should be labeled.

Compartment 36

The Recreational Facilities and Opportunities comments say the HCP and Shingle Mill are on both sides of the river. Actually, only the Shingle Mill is on both sides. The HCP is officially on the east side only.

Map:

- Part of the $\frac{3}{4}$ mile and 1 $\frac{1}{4}$ mile loops of the Shingle Mill pathway were left off.
- The power line does not run along Sturgeon Valley road west of about Rd 77, on the road to Song of the Morning Ranch north of the section line, or on Sturgeon Valley and Twin Lakes roads east of Rd 78. The phone line does run in these areas though.
- As we discussed at the Open House, the creek does not extend through the north arm of stand 65. Instead, it ends just north of the stand pointer for stand 30. Also, there is a second unnamed creek that goes westerly from the river starting at about the "90" in the 42290 for stand 82 and ends somewhere near the stand 65 label.
- The campground and trailhead symbols on top of each other at Pigeon Bridge campground makes both not legible.
- There are several horse riding connector routes on closed roads in the compartment. Consider adding a symbol to show them.
- Consider changing the symbol for Ford Lake road and West Round Lake trail to "County Poor Dirt Road".

Compartment 42

Map:

- Consider changing the symbol for Gornick trail, Black River trail, Greens trail, and Old Vanderbilt road south and east of the north line of section 31 to "County Poor Dirt Road".
- Two open roads are shown going east off Black River trail in stands 9 and 6. They are not officially open roads, though the one through stand 6 has been open for many years. If you recommend making them open roads, they should be added to the list of roads recommended to become open when the PRC road system is updated.
- The section of Green's trail going south of Old Vanderbilt road through stands 66, 67, 71 & 88 to the intersection of what is shown as a closed road has not previously been a county road. Instead, what is shown as a closed road through stand 88 has been the county road, but Scott tells me that the Otsego County Road Commission officially approved moving the county road. Since part of the new segment is outside of the easement that was granted to Otsego County, consider sending a letter to the Otsego County Road Commission saying that the change is okay with the DNR.

Large white pine are prescribed to be left in several of the red pine cuts that appear to have red pine as the management objective. Having a mix of species is a good thing, just be aware that white pine reproduction will be significant if there is anything close to 10 BA or more of residual sawlog size white pine.

As I said earlier, I think the 2017 YOE prescriptions look good. The nature of the process is that I am focusing mainly on suggestions which could give the

impression that I have a negative view of the work done. On the contrary, I think a very good job was done.

Thanks for the opportunity to comment.

Joe

Compartment Specific changes made during the Compartment Review:

Compartment 8 (Stand examiner – Richard McDonald)

Changes made at compartment review:

- Stand 75 – Get a written comment from Fisheries Division, Natural Rivers program. Remove site condition from the stand. Also, remove any management comments from the general stand comments.
- Stand 74 – Focus retention along west edge of the harvest-area retention, not scattered trees.

Compartment 16 (Stand examiner – Richard McDonald)

Changes made at compartment review:

- Stands 83, 3 and 72 – Add recreation trail protection comments.

Compartment 29 (Stand examiner – Richard McDonald)

No changes made at compartment review.

Compartment 36 (Stand examiner – Greg Rekowski)

Changes made at compartment review:

- Stands 66, 76, 77 and 78 – Add recreation trail protection specifications to these non-forested treatments.
- Seek alternative funding sources for prescription burns in the “Big tree” management block.

Compartment 42 (Stand examiner – Greg Rekowski)

Changes made at compartment review:

- The seasonal road between Green’s Landing and Black River trail is being proposed for closure. The Open House/Web post map showed it as a closed road, but it was not mentioned specifically anywhere. The road was abandoned by the county and became state owned.